

THE NATIONAL EVALUATION CENTER FOR HEALTH TECHNOLOGY

Appendix. Data Quality Reporting Checklist

| # | Component/Question | Response/Details |
|--|---|---|
| Section 1: Dataset Overview | | |
| 1 | Data owner and contact information | |
| 3 | Description of the role of data distributor/owner in data collection and processing | |
| 4 | Dates of most recent version of available data | |
| 6 | Data refresh/release plans | Documentation of the timing and nature of future updates to the data domains in the data source |
| 7 | Supplemental or other data sources available upon request or with additional transformation requirements. Include documentation user interfaces and data collection instruments ('First Instance' data sources) | Examples could include access to narrative text to enable medical chart review or NLP. Access to supply chain data for medical device identification. Access to patient reported outcomes in semi-structured format for outcomes tracking, etc. |
| Section 2: Data Sources (repeat for each data source as needed) | | |
| 8 | Name of data source and version number or date of extraction | |

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |

| | | |
|-----------|---|---|
| 9 | Type of data | e.g. EHR, insurance, registry, patient surveys, spontaneous reports, other (specified) |
| 10 | Time frame of data collection | |
| 11 | Geographic location | |
| 12 | Type of contributing organizations | |
| 13 | Level of observation | Patient, encounter, etc |
| 14 | Inclusions/exclusion criteria applied at source | |
| 15 | Number of unique observations | |
| 16 | Number of unique patients (if not at patient level) | |
| 17 | Longitudinality of the data | Documentation of the date ranges of availability of different data domains within the data source |
| 18 | Basic population summary | e.g. distributions of age, race, ethnicity, sex, geography, insurance coverage, domain-specific high level clinical concepts or exposures |
| 19 | Context of data collection | e.g., routine clinical care, trial participation, registry chart abstraction, survey, administrative claims records |
| 20 | Surveys implemented | Names and citations for any previously published and validated surveys used |
| 21 | Self-reported features | Note any features/variables that are self-reported by patients |
| 22 | Unique identifiers/keys | Note any features that on their own or in combination serve as a unique identifier for a patient, device, etc. |

| | | |
|-----------|---|--|
| | | If device unique identifiers are included, note whether lot or serial number are available, UDI/DI/PI available, and how this information is stored |
| 23 | Device indication for use | Note whether indication for device use was recorded and format of indication data |
| 24 | Permission to use identifiers for further data linkage | Note which identifiers (if any) may be used to link these source data with other data sources and whether permissions are in place to use identifiers for linkage |
| 25 | Known reasons for missingness, out of range values, and impact on data completeness | List known reasons for incomplete data collection, proportion of observations impacted, known out of range or erroneous values, and describe subpopulation variance in missingness. E.g., temporal workflow or participation changes |
| 26 | Methods for promoting outcome ascertainment | Document proportion of observations without complete follow-up during outcome window and describe any data linkage efforts to improve outcome coverage in the source data |
| 27 | Participation rate | Report proportion of anticipated population captured (e.g., proportion of cases or sites included in a registry) or patient response rate |
| 28 | Supplemental data generation | If supplemental data are generated as part of the data source collection process specifically for the ETL, careful |

| | | |
|-----------|--|--|
| | | documentation, verification, and accuracy checks and validation should be provided. |
| 29 | Informed consent | Document informed consent for secondary use practices and/or obtained waivers of informed consent. Note any limitations of the informed consent process that may introduce bias into the data |
| 30 | Privacy preserving data restrictions | Document any filtering, sampling, aggregation, or restrictions used to exclude records in the interest of protecting privacy |
| 31 | Requirements for protecting data privacy | Document privacy requirements of the originating data source. E.g., human subjects training for users, storage or security requirements. |
| 32 | Relevant regulation/policies | Note any federal, state, local, or source institution regulations/policies that must be adhered to when using these data |
| 33 | Evaluation of sample and data collection bias | Document whether any patient subgroups had limited access to care or participation in the settings from which data was collected (e.g., due to insurance status or language barriers). Note observed variation in documentation practices, clinical care practices, study enrollment practices, or patient response rates during data collection |
| 34 | Documentation of data collection process deviation | Document deviations from established data capture processes, if present. Document assessments for impact on |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| | | the dataset (e.g., completeness, accuracy, and consistency) |
| Section 3: Extraction, Transformation, Loading | | |
| 35 | Documentation of the data model that is being used to represent the data. | If a publicly available data model, reference the version used. If an internally developed model, full documentation of the tables, elements, fields, definitions, and conventions to be used in ETL. |
| 36 | Implementation of the data model (ETL process) and documentation of incremental updates | Careful documentation of the implementation of the data model from the data source(s), including any non-standard transformations, conventions, conflicts with the data model definition specifications, and error checking/audit processes. Include data collection and workflows and interfaces to document 'First Instance' data collection. |
| 37 | Privacy preservation | Document any privacy preservation processes that are part of the ETL: date shifting, value aggregation, range/transformations, masking, filtering, or sampling |
| 38 | Documentation and characterization of controlled vocabularies | Document and characterize controlled vocabularies used by source data and during transformation. This would include descriptions of controlled vocabularies (e.g., ICD-9, ICD-10, CPT/HCPCS, NDC) in use, what versions, and the use of any mapping tools, conventions, or vocabularies used to convert between vocabularies as part of the ETL process (NDC -> RxNorm, ICD9CM -> SNOMED-CT, etc). |

| | | |
|----|---|--|
| 39 | Data quality evaluations on the transformed (loaded) data | Document assessment of whether standardized data definitions, standardized chart review procedures, and standardized data extraction processes were utilized. If algorithmic or automated tools are used to transform and load data into a data model for reuse, an audit trail with documentation of the algorithms, tools, and error-checks used to perform this task should be documented |
| 40 | Summary of missingness | e.g. proportion missing age, race, ethnicity, sex, geography, insurance coverage, domain-specific high level clinical concepts or exposures. |
| 41 | Summary of data element duplication or redundancy | Report data element duplication or redundancy. |
| 42 | Evaluation of measurement bias | <p>Frequency - Document any variations in missingness across key subpopulations</p> <p>Precision/accuracy - Document any data features that may have varying precision or accuracy in select patient subgroups</p> |
| 43 | Data cross-reference validations | Error checking practices through data fields validation, verification or cross-checking against other data fields or data sources |
| 44 | Data Storage and use | Document data storage and infrastructure |
| 45 | Data dictionary | Attach detailed data dictionary, including for each feature: field name, description, data type, category |

| | | |
|--------------------------------|---|--|
| | | definitions or data standard used, whether mapped to a CDM, representation of missing values, reasonable range of values if applied. |
| Section 4: Data Linkage | | |
| 46 | Names and version of linked data sources (refer to section 2) | |
| 47 | Purpose of linkage | Describe why data sources were linked |
| 48 | Was patient consent required prior to linkage? | Yes/No |
| 49 | Was a waiver of informed consent obtained? | Yes/No (if yes, list IRB approving waiver; if no, explain why not) |
| 50 | Population overlap | Document how well the data sources overlap and expected proportion of observations that may be linkable |
| 51 | Linkage algorithm and process | Provide details for each linkage step, including whether deterministic/probabilistic, features used, thresholds applied, and if/how confidence is reported |
| 52 | Privacy protections associated with linkage | Describe privacy protections (one way hashing, tokens). If fully de-identified, provide expert determination review letter. |
| 53 | Match rate | Report match rate, overall and by key subgroups |
| 54 | Linkage validation methods | Document approach to validating linkages |
| 55 | Linkage accuracy | Report linkage accuracy statistics, overall and by key subgroups |

| | | |
|------------------------------|--|---|
| 56 | Linkage dependencies | Were any external (to data ecosystem) tools, environments, and processes required to link data sources? Document all dependencies on data linkage that are not explicitly within the data environment in which the data product resides. |
| Section 5: Governance | | |
| 57 | Documentation of the process for user access | Documentation to specify what types of users can reuse the data. |
| 58 | Documentation of delay between data collection and downstream operational and research use | Documentation of the approvals, documentations, and regulatory reviews necessary to obtain access. |
| 59 | Anticipated data delays | Documentation of delay between data collection and downstream operational and research use |
| 60 | Prior use for research | Include citations for research publications using these data |
| 61 | Prior use for regulatory decisions | Include citations for regulatory decisions based on these data |
| 62 | Permitted uses | Describe permitted use cases |
| 63 | Limitations of use | Note specific restrictions on use of entire dataset or components of dataset |
| 64 | Requirements for access | Defined necessary training and/or use agreements required to access the data, including contact information for requesting access. |
| 65 | Infrastructure requirements | Define any technical requirements for transfers, securely storing, and analyzing data, including data security requirements. |

| | | |
|----|-------------------------------------|--|
| 66 | Shareholder involvement | Describe any engagement and participation in dataset curation by key shareholder groups (e.g., clinicians, patients) |
| 67 | Expertise and training assurance | Documentation of site training, support, and personnel that conduct data collection and transformation |
| 68 | Funding disclosure | Disclosure all sources of funding related to data Infrastructure requirements |
| 69 | Conflicts of interest | Acknowledge any potential conflicts of interest among key organizations and individuals involved in data Infrastructure requirements |
| 70 | Recommended citation for data users | |

Note: Table adapted for secondary use medical device data sources from: *Gatto et al. Using real-world data and analytics to support decision making in a global pandemic: Lessons learned. Manuscript under review*